

Changing Perspectives Between Chinese Landscape Painting of Song Dynasty in the Tenth to Thirteenth Century and Western Landscape Painting in the Seventeenth to Nineteenth Century: Seeing Through Chinese Aesthetic Viewpoints and Pre-Qin Daoism

Verena Xiwen Zhang⁵

ABSTRACT

*This paper aimed at comparing the difference and similarity between Chinese landscape painting in the Northern and Southern Song dynasties and western landscape painting during the seventeenth century to nineteenth century through interdisciplinary method of combining David Sack's sociological framework, Chinese aesthetic criteria of landscape and philosophical thoughts of Pre-Qin Daoism. **Firstly**, it applies Sack's axis of Subjectivity-Objectivity to explicate Philips Koninck, Jean-Simeon Chardin, John Constable, Eugene Boudin and even Claude Monet's Impressionist paintings are deeply rooted in "objective scientific observer's perspective" though every artist has unique artistic style due to personal "subjective participant perspective" which has solid fundament on the basis of subjectivity. Take Constable and Boudin as examples to explore their reflections on "skies" which have their own philosophy. In spite of their contemplation on the essence of "skies" – God-like "infinity," they admitted it's impossibility to depict the essence of phenomenon such as infinity and finally turned to paint the changing clouds intending to grasp every beautiful movement of shadows and light, same did Impressionist successors such as Renoir and Monet. Although outwardly stressed on the changeable phenomenon of light and shade in his idea – "Landscape is only an impression, its appearance changing at every moment," Monet seemed unconsciously seeking the essence of Camille's faded light in her dying appearance. Secondly, through analysing the track of Monet's creation from 1870s to 1920s, the graceful Zigzag – "Waving-Line" defining the increasing proportion of special "emptiness" represented by skies, rivers, seas and ponds showing his quest for internal peace, tranquility and spiritual infinity embodied by his design of composition, gradual simplification and abstraction of form through retained multiplicity of luxuriant color-experimented which all related to the artist's spiritual realm with unique subjectivity.*

By contrast, paralleled by the track from the Northern Song to the Southern Song dynasties, Guo Xi and Fan Kuan's "monumental landscape" paintings not only featured by giant mountains as if Monet's Rouen Cathedral series with one-point perspective, instead, also characterized by Cavalier perspective through which viewers can freely choose different angles to catch every scene in a painting as a whole. Furtherly, Ma Lin and Ma Yuan's paintings had their own "depth" on experiencing the dilemma of life and death at a philosophical level, represented by jagged rhythms of pine trees and rocks, poetic geometry of angular forms and the increasing proportion of empty space reflecting their own spiritual realm. It is related to a philosophical wisdom of seeing through the changing phenomenon and unfolding the essence and depth of life and death because they experienced lots of wars caused by the social-political instability and

turmoil. The final part introduces four aesthetic criteria in Chinese landscape painting proposed by contemporary scholar, Lai Huiling – “Clarity” (qing), “Simplicity” (jian), “Exquisiteness” (gao) and “Remoteness” (yuan) to connect with philosophical thoughts of Zhuangzi in Pre-Qin Daoism. It concludes that subjectivity is not as abstract as a whole as in western tradition but could be discussed through its main components such as “heart” (xin), “human nature” (xing) and sentiments (qing). Chinese aesthetic and philosophical thinking mode emphasising more on “heart” and “human nature” different from psychological emotions, sentiments in western cultural tradition may provide new visions for our contemporaries mainly influenced and grown up under western educational systems to recreate some brand-new, innovative ways through our concluding remark on a potential trajectory of evolution in artistic thought both in western and Chinese landscape paintings.

Journal: Boston Research Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities (Abbreviation: BRJSSH)

Keywords: landscape painting, Chinese aesthetics, Daoism, subjectivity, objectivity, Impressionism, Claude Monet, zigzag, abstraction, simplification, emptiness, clarity, simplicity, exquisiteness, remoteness, Guo Xi, Fan Kuan, Ma Lin, Ma Yuan, Laozi, Zhuangzi, heart, xin

Accepted: 18 April 2025

Published: 15 June 2025

ISSN: Online ISSN: 2834-4863 | Print ISSN: 2834-4855

Language: English

Research ID: 71d73dcb-5619-497e-a8d7-53eca085a88a

Type: Peer-Reviewed Research Article (Open Access)



The authors declare that no competing interests exist. The authors contributed equally to this work. This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License as an open access article. CC BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>)

Read Online: <https://bit.ly/3SsYS8V>

Author: 廖 - Tunghai University, Taiwan

I. INTRODUCTION

In comparison with the difference and similarity between Chinese landscape painting of Northern and Southern Song dynasties in the tenth to thirteenth century and western landscape painting in the seventeenth to nineteenth century, this paper attempts to explore the issue by introducing Robert David Sack's (1980) scheme which contains two axes – (1) the axis of Objectivity-Subjectivity and (2) the axis of Space-Matter (Figure 1.2, Chapter 1).¹ First of all, even if we trace back to the Renaissance, in retrospect of art history, western artist's perspective though contains unique, subjective, artistic perspective, it never kept away from scientific, objective perspective, to which I transferred a pair of sociological terms borrowed

from Talcott Parsons and Jurgen Habermas – the “objective observer's perspective”/ “scientific observer's perspective” and “subjective participant's perspective” – the former relates to a subject, as a calm observer is kind of “external existence,” standing outside the object he/she observes; the latter refers to a subject with subjective view to participate in research, mainly humanistic but it's a debate under discussion. This pair of terms well discloses the relativity of subjectivity and objectivity. Of course an artist as an observer is “different from” the object he/she observes, but it should be explained that in what sense we say there is some kind of “subjectivity” infusing into the artist's representation? How could we explicate the relation of this kind of “subjectivity” with the spiritual realm and the function of “empty space” while appreciating

Chinese landscape painting? In Sack's words, "Different mixtures of subjectivity and objectivity to Probably one characterize the other modes of thought as well. (Sack 1980: 24)" of the most complicated problems encountered by art historians or aesthetic scholars who try to construct aesthetic theory is how to explain the relation of subjectivity and objectivity in terms of artist's perspective and beholder's perspective. This unstable ambivalence also a little bit appears in Michael Baxandall's *Patterns of Intention: On the Historical Explanation of Pictures*.³ In spite of the tiny ambivalence, Baxandall's viewpoint throughout the whole book is very clear – he would stress the importance of artist's subjectivity more than the objectivity embodied in a painting, in his words, artist's representation. In the following analysis, I would like to reveal a different kind of viewpoint, which is constructed under Chinese philosophical scheme, especially philosophical Daoism, to discuss the relation of subjectivity and objectivity in terms of western landscape painting and Chinese landscape painting.

Now let's start from our focus on the axis of Subjectivity–Objectivity in Sack's scheme. The objective observer's perspective, which relates to scientific objectivity presented in artworks, embodies not only since the Renaissance but also in the following glorious periods of art history. For example, Philips Koninck (1619–1688) drew and painted landscapes and ships in panoramic perspective which meant a supreme–panorama open up before viewers; Jean–Simeon Chardin (1699–1779)'s paintings were affected by optics prevailing at his time. Chardin had attended scientific lectures held by the French Academy and accepted suggestion from his friend, a scientist of the Academy.⁴ At the end of eighteenth century to the beginning of nineteenth century, John Constable (1776–1837), a landscape painter who was influenced by meteorology in his time, constructed his idea of sky, a kind of "empty space" related to our further discussion, through his knowledge of meteorology, hues of colors and the proposition of how to arrange "space" in his composition. In Constable's "scientific observer's perspective" we could find out some similar difficulties encountered by Chinese landscape painters who had different "methods" to deal with, while Constable was contemplating his "skies", especially when his contemplation triggered the philosophical concept "infinity". Constable

expressed how the old, traditional masters thought of their skies and make the comparison between their idea of skies and that of his own:

That landscape painter who does not make his skies a very material part of his composition, neglects to avail himself of one of his greatest aids. Sir Joshua Reynolds, speaking of the landscape of Titian, of Salvator, and of Claude, says: 'Even their skies seem to sympathise with their subjects.' I have often been advised to consider my sky as a white sheet thrown behind the objects.' Certainly, if the sky is obtrusive, as mine are, it is bad; but if it is evaded, as mine are not, it is worse; it must and shall always with me make an effectual part of the composition. It will be difficult to name a class of landscape in which the sky is not the key note, the standard of scale, and the chief organ of sentiment. You may conceive, then, what a 'shite sheet' would do for me, impressed as I am with these notions, and they cannot be erroneous. *The sky is the source of light in nature, and governs everything; even our common observations on the weather of every day are altogether suggested by it.*" (Leslie 1845: 92)

That is to say, the importance of "sky" ("empty space") in traditional old painters' eyes are not equal to Constable; in the traditional perspective, artists only consider "sky" "a white sheet thrown behind the objects"– the background and in comparison, with Constable's predecessors like Chardin who follows the principle of optics and always let the background painted dark dim and objects in foreground bright with distinctness. For this reason, Constable was always advised to let his skies evade into the background but he refused to do so. Constable had his own idea about "sky" that is "the source of light in nature, and governs everything". In western culture, if you use the metaphor of something as almost "the source of light" and "governs everything", you almost promote that "something" to the ultimate source which equals the position of "God". When Constable in his naturalistic viewpoints valued the concept of "sky" as religious "God", it's impossible that he left such a meaningful symbol designated to ultimate God in the dim background; in *The Last Supper*, Jesus Christ was situated in the center of Leonardo da Vinci's composition in one–point perspective; in Michelangelo's fresco, God had never evaded into background and always set as "the key note", the standard of scale in terms of human development, and the chief channel of expressing pure, sacred

sentiments. In Constable's naturalistic mind, he praised the "sky" in his landscape paintings as the same position of religious "God". It's impossible for him to neglect the importance and the effectual function of sky in his composition. Also for this reason, he suffered the great difficulty:

"The great *difficulty* of skies in painting is very great, both as to composition and execution; because, with all their brilliancy, they all not to come forward, or in indeed, be hardly thought of any more than extreme distances are; but this does not apply to phenomena or accidental effects of sky, because they always attract particularly." (Leslie 1845: 92)

The above passage corresponds to Sack's words that different mixture of subjectivity and objectivity had different modes of thought and it also proved that Constable had his own idea about how to arrange the proportion and relation of space (distance) and substance (which belongs to Sack's another axis of Space and Substance). He highlighted the variation of accidentally changing clouds through his observation of atmospheric change which was one of his favorite activities. In spite of that Constable did think of the infinite distance in the sky, he quickly shifted to persuade himself that "infinity" could not be applied to common phenomenon – the accidental change of clouds and to "neglect" to contemplate the problem of "infinity" in the faraway distance of sky. By contrast, why did Chinese landscape painters from the Song dynasty to Yuan dynasty, chose to "neglect" those various changes of clouds in their skies and let those skies evade in the background and even small birds or ships vanished in the far distance, mingled with sky and river? Were Chinese not capable of taking "scientific observer's viewpoint" to "perceive" and "represent" phenomena in a "scientific" way? Did the method of "scientific observer's perspective" in painting, architecture only belong to western mind? What kind of philosophical thoughts support Chinese painters to construct their idea of "empty space" in contrast to western "sky"?

Before answering the above questions, keeping Sack's scheme of axis of Subjectivity-Objectivity and axis of Space-Substance in mind would be helpful to our further analysis. In the previous discussion, we mainly focus on the axis of subjective-objective perspective of artist to reveal that many western artists from Renaissance to the early nineteenth century had been influenced by the development

of scientific knowledge including Scientific Revolution and Enlightenment which have been the main **orientation** in western culture. The previous discussion highlights the claim that most of western painters couldn't avoid taking scientific observers' perspective to represent what they perceive. To form this claim, which is quite different from Baxandall's stress on the artist's subjective perspective, I shall remind readers that Chinese philosophical thinking mode is a necessary underground presupposed, which is different from Baxandall's basic presuppose that a kind of sociological "internalization" is required. Now I would like to continue our main line of Sack's two axes, even Impressionism characterized by using strokes of multiple layers of colors to create the subjective atmosphere, which looks like subjective feelings run riot, unlimitedly with artist's free will, actually deeply roots in strictly scientific objective observations in their diligent sketches and drawings.

For example, Eugene Boudin (1824–1898), named "the painter of sky" –the one who triggered artistic enlightenment for Claude Monet, known as one of the Father of Impressionism, likes to observe large pieces of clouds, piled block by block in the sky, interested in the change of phenomenon in the sky; a famous aesthetic commentator Xun Jiang (蒋勳) provides us his sharp viewpoint that even to represent broadest sky, in western way of artistic expression of sky, western painters like Boudin chose to use various types of white to pile up multiple white blocks in three dimensions. To the finest, the most delicate degree, another representative Impressionist Renoir could use various shades of white to represent the transparent cloudy wind, and dresses, coruscatingly blazing in the sunshine with lightning transparency and clarity that is to say, on the axis of Space-Substance, western painters chiefly concern about visualized images of objects changing in space instead of empty space from which the symbolic meaning of infinity comes. In short, "empty space" had never become a "theme" in the western art history. Claude Monet applied the similar method like Boudin piling up white clouds in clusters to depict his sky in *Woman in a Parasol – Madame Monet and His Son* (National Gallery of Art, Washington DC, 1875), in which the sky was occupied with a cluster of different hues of white clouds as a figure-hugging background to show through a dark huge woman standing out in

silhouette. It seems that behind the way of increasing overlapping blocks of the subtle hues of white, there is an artistic thinking mode of "addition".

So far as we have discussed, even Impressionism, featuring artists using multiple hues of colors to represent light and shade in order to express the changing sentiments, moods of being a subject in every moment, has still deeply rooted scientific objective observation. That is not to say, the western orientation of art creation and appreciation only stresses on the side of scientific observation or we couldn't make the difference between science and art. Take Claude Monet's reflection on Camille's death after forty years later.⁸ Monet expressed his idea as follows:

"For me, a landscape does not exist in its own right, since its appearance changes at every moment. But its surroundings bring it to life—the air and the light, which very continually. For me, it is only the 'surrounding atmosphere' which gives subjects their true value."(House 1986: 28–9)

But if it's true as Monet supposed, why did he memorize Camille's face with so much changing hue of colors 40 years later? What's the unchangeable part inside Monet's heart that made him think Camille's face was "meant so much" to him? Didn't he consciously seek the carnival of colors which mostly lead him to his inner nature, kind of peaceful harmony and tranquility and represented in most of his landscape paintings? Didn't he unconsciously seek the essence of appearance through every possible innovative pile of colors tuned in every slice of living moment?

In the above discussion, we are primarily concerned about the element of "color" and the route of our discussion is delineated on the axis of Subjectivity–Objectivity. Now we introduce Sack's another axis of Space–Matter to keep on our further analysis. Readers may try to imagine a horizontal axis of Subjectivity–Objectivity and another vertical axis of Space–Matter forming four quadrants by which our discussion is proceeding continuously. On the vertical axis of Space–Matter, we attempt to analyze the element of "composition" in western and Chinese landscape generally.¹¹ These things come in pairs – Ge Zhaoguang (葛兆光) proposes that there are four elements – color, composition, location and deformation – could be helpful for analyzing the historical evolution of thought if scholars are fond of the relation between pictorial

research and history of thought (Ge 2006: 139–141).¹² In his discussion of composition, Ge said, *"Angle (of artist), extent chosen (by artist), the change of proportion are worthy of discussion...Some artists depict some matter exaggerated large and draw something extremely small; some depict object matters upside down; some have one thing enlarged and the other foreshortened – drew matters out of proportion in a picture; some see object matter from this angle and others see from that angle (Ge 2006: 140)."*¹³ Apparently Camille with a parasol whose figure was enlarged out of proportion and his son was shrunk to a very small size¹⁴. But what does it matter with the evolution of thought in Monet's landscape painting? In comparison with Monet's works from the 1870s to 1880s, the composition of his landscape painting basically had become departed from traditional way of perspective.¹⁵ From the end of 1880s to 1920s, an indiscernible tendency to abandon one–point perspective gradually became apparent. It is worthwhile to mention that the element of William Hogarth's Zigzag – "Waving–Line"¹⁶ (also known as "S-shaped curved line") in Monet's composition indiscernible existed since the end of 1870s accompanying perspective, which gradually became a notable feature in the scenery of cliffs, valley, lanes, floating ice, caps, fields of poppies in the 1880s. In the 1900s, the S-curve has its own deformation – Poplars on the Epte series represented more than 17 kinds of serpentine S-curve and readers may find two as typical type which drifted onto the Water Lilies from 1900s to 1920s—one kind could be seen in the Poplars on the Epte (National Galleries of Scotland, 1891) in which viewers can find one elegant S-curved line formed by a fringe of emerald green poplars fading away in the sky, and the other S-curved line emerged from the fading point to the right corner of picture, structured by the reflection of the green fringe. The two graceful S-curved lines in The Seine at Port-Villez series – Clear weather (The National Gallery, London, 1894), Blue Effect (Private Collection), Pink Effect (Museum Marmottan–Monet, Paris, 1894), and Morning on the Seine at Giverny, the Fog 17 (Private Collection, 1897) etc. were almost diluted invisibly that made the union of vaporous sky and hazy sea and the "enlarged empty space" almost creating a kind of misty and ethereal effect close to Chinese landscape painting. In spite of the fact that there are still other types of composition Monet' inclined to use –A horizontal line cut the picture in half –

one is sky and the other is fields of flowers and grass, sometimes between which there is a very tiny dark fringe of green trees interwoven this horizontal line as kind of decoration, and this way of cutting a picture in half may cause a sense of vast expanse and infinity of blue sky and colorful fields of flowers and grass, of which the view of artist and spectator come to an angle just like one technique from the "Doctrine of Three Types of Distance" (sanyuan fa 三遠法)¹⁸ (Bush & Shih 1985, 2012: 168-9; Casey 2002: 102), which is, "Level Distance" (平遠法) firstly proposed by the prominent Chinese landscape painter Guo Xi (Kuo Hsi 郭熙) (ca.1000-90) in the Northern Song dynasty, meant, from near mountains gazing at distant mountains.¹⁹ (Clewis 2019: 41-2; Hay, Mair, Bush&Shih 2005: 386) The famous example is Guo Xi's Old Trees, Level Distance (《樹色平遠圖》) in The Metropolitan Museum of Art²⁰ (Foong 2000: 87-115); the other type of Monet's composition frequently represented as the huge subject matter in the Rouen Cathedral series almost occupying the whole picture without saving any empty space and the haystack was in close-up in the Haystack series in which readers also can find out the indiscernible S-curved line, through which Monet just like a curious child playfully used camera zooming in and out to search for the best epicenter, I would like to focus the discussion on the increasing proportion of domains – "empty space" formed by sky, sea, water, pond, etc. demarcated by the S-curve line parallel to the special composition of Chinese landscape painting in the Southern Song and the transition from the combination with one-point perspective since 1870s to 1890s in his land-based landscape painting to the abandonment of it during 1900s to 1920s in his aquatic-Water Lilies series.

During the World War II (1914-1918), Monet dedicated himself to the Water Lilies series in which viewers may discover the increasing proportion of bottomless ponds depicted by hues of green – from light to saturated zucchini green – to various of blue –petrol, navy and Prussian blue sometimes mix up with light pink, mulberry or wine red ripples of flowers reflections, which symbolic the artist's inner "empty space" – no matter how many colorful images of phenomenon emerged from the pond, there is always a peaceful, quiet empty space ontologically as a basis of changeable phenomena, just like Monet expressed his purpose of creation is to provide the public "a refuge of peaceful

meditation."²¹ (The Museum of Modern Art 2013: 80; DeGalan 2020)

It seems to remind me that the gradual transition of Monet's viewpoint from painting the huge Haystacks, the Rouen Cathedral series to the Water Lilies series has parallels in Chinese landscape painting, of which the compositional transition from the Northern Song.²² The famous example is Fan Kuan's (范寬) magnificent hanging-scroll *Travellers Among Mountains and Streams* (National Palace Museum, Taipei) (《谿山行旅圖》)²³ (Jiang 2013) in which vertical and monumental-like mountains situated in the front and center of the painting (Delbanco 1992: 25; Li 2013: 364) For this reason, he was nicknamed Fan Zhongli (范中立), meant a person with upright, rectitude virtue, "standing firmly on earth with feet apart and with head reaching into heaven (Li 2013: 364) just like "Monumental Landscape." Another famous representative is Guo Xi (郭熙). James Cahill in A Pure and Remote View Lecture series proposed that Guo Xi was in the same Monumental Landscape tradition with Fan Kuan and Yen Wen-kuei (燕文貴), he depicted Guo Xi's The Early Spring (《早春圖》) as follows:

"Composition: it preserves much of Fan K'uan and Yen Wen-kuei model, while moving into a more subjective, particular vision of the world, still tripartite in both ways. (etc.) But the grand vision of the world is in flux, going through a]process of change – all the LS masses undercut or overhanging, and the whole seems to have the inner energy of a vast organism. Earth masses are shaded for the effect of rotundity; not so much texture strokes as overlaid brushstrokes that make them appear earthy rather than rocky. Strong effect of light and shadow, although no consistent light source (never in Ch ptg). Has the same basic underlying quasi-narrative: people at base engaged in real-world activities; then ascent to temple near top; then pure nature towering above that." (Cahill "Notes of A Pure and Remote View Lecture – 7B"

During the Southern Song, "painters abandoned this compositional line of central vertical division and employed the diagonal line of division instead. A square space is divided into two triangles, and the Southern Song painters planned their compositions by arranging their emphatic elements in one of the triangles – thus leaving the other triangle more or less empty."²⁷ (Li 2013: 365)

In comparison to Monet's artworks in the 1920s, they had a tendency towards some features: in addition to the increasing proportion of empty space by S-curved line, the simplification of composition giving up one-point perspective, and the most significant transition to abstraction of form. It's the time when the rising of Cubism, Abstractionism, Dadaism and Surrealism had become mainstream in the western art, "Monet's slightly sloppy lines, at once real and surreal, blurry, and overlapping blossoms and willow reflections on the water seemed to place a final exclamation mark on the Impressionist school."²⁸ As if Chen Kuang-yi (陳貺怡) proposed that whether Monet is an Impressionist painter or not in terms of the Water Lilies series is a very complicated issue, here I just try to offer a perspective emerged from Chinese landscape vision and from the thoughts of philosophical Daoism. Seeing through the framework of Chinese philosophy characterized by a traditional "introspective" cultural tendency, though the style of Monet's painting in the 1920s turned to abstraction but not contain the sense of "Clarity" (qing 清), "Purity" (chun-cuei 純粹), and "Transparency" (qing-tou/min-gxi 清透/明晰) which might reflect the artist's inner spiritual realm. I've quite often pondered that Monet seemed the luckiest artist when the World War II had blown millions of people's lives, he still could have a quiet corner of his garden at Giverny to create peaceful beauty through his diligent labor. More than this God seemed to make a joke of Monet's eyesight at the expense of his health and the progress of artistic career. In spite of this, "when God closes a door, somewhere he opens a window." In this issue, this "somewhere" may be discovered through the Way (Dao) of classical Chinese philosophy – a "introspective" perspective of representation in which we may unfold a potential possibility opening to Impressionists like Monet. If a viewer with an aesthetic vision of Chinese landscape painting which especially deeply rooted in philosophical Daoism, one may find that Chinese landscape painting just like Zhuangzi's philosophy seeking the the balance between being talented and untalented²⁹ – a kind of wisdom of never going extreme to hurt others or the self – when he discovered the Way (Dao) of existing in the world, featured the balance between formal realism and abstraction as well as in the content and form seeking "Clarity" (清 qing, i.e. represented by using of colors), "Simplicity" (簡 jian, i.e. represented by composition, brushstrokes), "Exquisiteness" (高 gao;

高妙 gaomiao) in artistic atmosphere and artist's spiritual realm and "Remoteness" (遠 yuan, remoteness in distance) symbolizes seclusion and peace in spiritual realm usually accompanied by living a cloistered life – transcendence and seclusion from secular world since Chinese artists were conscious of inability to impede the fall of the Northern and Southern Song.

The four aesthetic criteria of Chinese landscape painting proposed by Lai Huiling³⁰ not only represent in the Chinese landscape painting but also reflect the inner spiritual realm of artists which relate to traditional Chinese philosophy. For example, in Ma Lin's (馬麟) Hidden Fragrance and Scattered Shadows (暗香疏影), the white plum blossoms delicately painted with transparent white as thin as cicada's wings, held by calyxes in mineral green. On the reflection, there are no ripples flying upon the surface of the pond but only subtle shades of white blossoms, diagonally starched branches and indiscernible shadows of bamboo leaves. The hidden fragrance seemed to permeate through the quiet atmosphere of tranquil night and cross over the clear, placid waters of the pond.³¹ The characteristic of "Clarity" also relates to the verse "Of old those that obtained the One Heaven obtained the One and became clear. Earth [phenomenon in the secular world] obtained the One and became tranquil,³² (Laozi, Chan trans. 1963: Ch.63) which could also be understood as "Of old those that corresponded to Dao (Way/ Natural law): When Heaven (Sky), symbolizing to the noumenon would, corresponds to Dao, it normally appears clear in everyday life; when Earth, symbolizing to the phenomenal world, corresponds to Dao (Natural law including various types of sub-laws, principles in natural and humanistic world), it appears peaceful and tranquil."³³ That is to say, the characteristic of "Clarity" quite often comes together with "Peace" and "Tranquility". When an artist as a creative subject whose heart is purified enough to correspond to Dao, one can reach inner peace and then expand this inner clarity, tranquility to one's external behavior including artistic creation and aesthetical appreciation. The parable in the Chapter 19 – "Mastering Life" of *Zhuangzi* explains this idea and also connected to the criterion of "Exquisiteness".³⁴ (*Zhuangzi*, Watson trans. 1983: Ch.19) In many types of Chinese art including painting, qin music, calligraphy, only when the artist is well self-cultivated and feels purified enough, can

he/she start to paint, play guin and create beautiful calligraphy. Monet in his late ages “seemed to have become increasingly concerned with how people should view his paintings.³⁵” (Chen 2011: 69) This is why I’ve mentioned about Monet’s painting in the 1920s hadn’t presented enough “Clarity” in terms of Chinese philosophical criteria of Clarity, Calm, and Transparency fundamentally rooted in artist’s inner spiritual realm– a kind of purposiveness without purpose although Monet expressed his “purposiveness” is to provide the public “a refuge of peaceful meditation,” (The Museum of ModernArt 2013: 80; DeGalan 2020) he still couldn’t avoid the intervention from people’s praise and denigration. Further, the quality of “Clarity” (清) relevant to “Tranquility”(靜) could be seen in *Zhuangzi*, “Water that is still gives back a clear image of beard and eyebrows; reposing in the water level, it offers a measure to the great carpenter. And if water in stillness possesses such clarity, how much more must pure spirit.”³⁶(*Zhuangzi*, Watson trans. 1983: Ch.13)

In terms of the criterion of “Simplicity”, we may take Scholar by a Waterfall (Album leaf, ink and color on silk, 24.9x26cm, Ex coll.: C.C. Wang Family, Gift of The Dillon Fund, 1973) by Ma Yuan (馬遠), a leading artist of the Northern Song Painting Academy, father of Ma Lin for example. “The monumental northern landscape style was largely abandoned in 1127, when the Song court was forced by invading Jurchen tribesmen to relocate to the south.³⁷”(Hearn 2008: Ch.9) In this painting, “which shows a gentleman in a gardenlike setting, the jagged rhythms of the pine tree and rock contrast with the quiet mood of the scholar, who gazes pensively into bubbling rapids of a cascade. Ma Yuan reduced nature to a poetic geometry of angular forms and emptiness. The diagonally divided ‘one corner’ composition leads from chiseled foreground forms to a mist-filled distance, from tactile rocks and trees to the sound of rushing water, from the sensory world to an awareness of the infinite.”³⁸ (Hearn 2008: Ch.9) The simplification (reduction from monumental style of Northern Song to angular form) of compositional design and increasing proposition of empty space symbolic a kind of Daoist thought of “Simplicity” (簡樸/ 樸素) which could be seen in the verse such as “In stillness you will be a sage, in action, a king. Resting in inaction, you will be honored; of unwrought simplicity, your beauty will be such that no one in the world may vie with you. (樸素而天下莫

能與之爭美).”³⁹ (*Zhuangzi*, Watson trans. 1983: Ch.13) There are at least two points in this verse. A “introspective” perspective of self-cultivation and self-realization to reach inner, peaceful stillness that may or may not lead one to be a winner like a king or millionaire in the secular world but will gradually guide one to the way of awakening and the fulfilment of inner spiritual realm.

The third Chinese aesthetic criterion “Exquisiteness” could be seen in many masterpieces of Chinese landscape painting. In the discussion of Chapter 19 – “Mastering Life” of *Zhuangzi*, the parable has already revealed purifying one’s heart and mind is the basis of achieving the highest artistic realm which includes fulfilling the criterion of “Clarity” and “Exquisiteness”. Those interesting parables of Chapter 19 could be summarized into a phrase, “He keeps his will undivided and concentrates his spirit,”⁴⁰ of which there is the secret of the hunchback gentleman to catch cicadas with a stick “as easily as though he were grabbing them with his hand.”⁴¹ (*Zhuangzi*, Watson trans. 1983: Ch.19)

Pure and Remote View of Streams and Mountains (National Palace Museum, from the twelfth century to the thirteenth century) (溪山清遠圖) by Xia Gui (夏圭), prominent leading artist of the Southern Song doubtlessly satisfied the demands of four aesthetic criteria of Chinese landscape painting. Here I would like to take it as an example to connect it with the fourth criterion “remoteness/distance” (遠). It’s also worthy of mention that Xia Gui represented “light” from heaven/sky with slightly washed ink that would make viewers astonished in such a way without any color. He brought us such beautiful, poetic light from remote, infinite heaven to earth.⁴² (Jiang2013: Ep.1)

Another reason for choosing this painting is that when we applicate Sack’s two axes to analyze this painting, we may find the axis of Space-Matter may not be enough to explain the concept of “remoteness” and “distance” here. Here we may add another axis of Time-Matter to enrich the structure of the diagram for stretching our heart and spiritual mind to infinity symbolized by misty empty space and light from heaven not only relevant to space but also connected to time. The great large proportion of remote empty space was designated to the dissolution of sense of time and space that lead artists and viewers to the progress of infinite

creation and self-realization. Chapter 23 - "Gengsang Chu" mentioned that "When the human heart [heart-mind system] is settled down, tranquilized with great peace, it originates from heavenly light that means infinite transcendental wisdom. When it comes from transcendental wisdom, humans present human nature and matters/phenomena present their own nature [as things-in-themselves]."

In conclusion, the analysis of similarities and differences between Chinese landscape painting in the tenth to thirteenth century and western landscape painting in the seventeenth to nineteenth century through Sack's axes of Subjectivity-Objectivity and Space-Matter, adding the elements of "heart" (xin 心) and "sentiments" (qing 情) in philosophical Daoism to distinguish the concept of "subjectivity" in the western culture from that in Chinese culture: the former often entails to "will" and "sensation" as in Kant's aesthetic judgment, the latter involves the more distinction of subject's components which is comprised of heart (xin 心), human nature (xing 性) - the nature of humans existence and the disposition of nature, as well as sentiments (qing 情) that would enrich the analytical dimension of subjectivity. The above discussion mainly highlights on the different effects caused from heart and sentiments and finally tries to conclude a potential trajectory of evolution in artistic thought both in western and Chinese landscape painting, that is: when western landscape painting like Impressionism wishes to go on better, Chinese aesthetic perspectives and traditional philosophical thought of Daoism may broaden a new horizon, after all, "Every cloud has a silver lining." The progress of achieving perfection is eternally infinite.

II. REFERENCES

1. Robert D. Sack, *Conceptions of Space in Social Thought: a Geographical Perspective*. Basingstoke (U.K.: Palgrave Macmillan, 1980), Ch.1.
2. Robert D. Sack, *Conceptions of Space in Social Thought: a Geographical Perspective*. Basingstoke (U.K.: Palgrave Macmillan, 1980), 24.
3. Michael Baxandall, *Patterns of Intention: On the Historical Explanation of Pictures* (U.S.: Yale University Press, 1985)
4. Although Baxandall emphasizes on the scientific perspective of our time is quite

different from that of Chardin's time, Chardin was not necessary to be influenced by scientific knowledge, not necessary to read Lock's theory and there's no critical relation between the ideas Chardin embodied in his paintings and Chardin's representations. I would like to point out that in a broad sense, Chardin might "probably" "possessed" the scientific viewpoint of optics since Baxandall provides us the information of Chardin's attendance of the lectures in Academy and his influence by scientist's suggestion.

5. i.e. Baby Powder, Cornsilk, Cream, Eggshell, Ivory, Old Lace, Rose White, Seashell, Snow, Titanic, Vanilla, etc.
6. See Pierre-Auguste Renoir, *Dance at Le Moulin de la Galette* (Musée d'Orsay, Paris, 1876) and another oil painting *Luncheon of the Boating Party* (The Phillips Collection, Washington, D.C., 1880-1881) Still other Renoir's famous painting *Girl in a Lace a Hat*, (Pola Museum of Art, 1891) which couldn't be easily attribute to portrait, was explicated by a variety of white colors to increase the effect of vivid changing of light and shadow. Liu Chiao-Mei (劉巧媚) introduces that the preference of "white lace caps, flowery straw hats, and bouffant, ribboned hats" characterize the style of late Renoir's painting which well corresponded to the diary of Julie Manet in which "Renoir had once made his own hat of white chiffon and roses, which he put on a model dressed in white, with a green belt." However, with the rise of industrialization, women with formal decorated hats were gradually out of fashion because it's bulky and clumsy when making cross-country train journeys. Most importantly, Liu pointed out that "whether he was following fashion or defying changing social conventions, each was in accordance with his own, individual choice. Either way, in *Girl in a Lace Hat*, the hat's cloth exhibits numerous and subtle color variations and transformations, increasing the radiance of the figure's appearance, assuming the role of makeup." See Liu Chiao-Mei (劉巧媚), "Renoir and Fashion," (雷諾瓦與時尚) in National Palace Museum, United Daily News Group, Pola Art Museum & Pola Art Foundation (國立故宮博物院、聯合報系、POLA 美術館與公益財團法人 POLA 美術振興財團), *Renoir and the Painters of the Twentieth Century* (《幸福大師 雷諾瓦與二十世紀繪畫》) [Text in bilingual: Chinese and English] (New Taipei City: United Daily

- News Group, 2013), 32. (新北市: 聯合報股份有限公司, 2013年5月), 頁32
7. Actually Xun Jiang (蔣勳) explicates a pair of terms “addition philosophy” (加法哲學) and “reduction philosophy” (減法哲學) in Chinese. Here I transfer this pair of terms into a kind of “thinking mode” with Sack’s words to avoid the argumentative meaning of “philosophy” in the western culture and in Chinese culture. See Xun Jiang (蔣勳), “History of Chinese Art (《中國美術史》),” [Video Lecture in Chinese] in The Gathering with Mr. Yin and Ms Yuan (殷璠小聚) (Hualien, Taiwan: Tzu Chi Da Ai TV) (花蓮: 慈濟大愛電視台).
 8. For example, our highly sensitive and affectionate artist uttered: “I found myself staring at the tragic countenance, automatically trying to identify the sequence, the proportion of light and shade in the colors that death imposed on the immobile face. Shades of blue, yellow, gray... Even before the thought occurred to memorize the face that meant so much to me, my first involuntary reflex was to tremble at the shock of colors. In spite of myself, my reflexes drew me into an unconscious operation that is the daily order of my life.” See Charles F. Stucky, ed., *Monet: A Retrospective* (New York: NY Hugh Lauter Levin, 1985) Readers may also reference to Monet’s *Camille on Her Deathbed* (Musée d’Orsay, Paris, France, 1879) in which different hues of white mixed with blue, green and gray, the piles of chilly white colors wildly wrapped Camille’s dead face just like four years ago, in *Woman in a Parasol – Madame Monet and His Son* (National Gallery of Art, Washington DC, 1875), Camille’s lace-white dress flyaway with fluttering hemline through which viewers may feel our female character was being dragged into a whirlpool of cloudy sky, seemingly symbolizing an unstable future. But this time, with the whirlpool of piles of various hues of white simply wrapped up and dragged into Camille herself. The gaze of Monet here, as he said, mainly focused on “the proportion of light and shade in the colors” which brought him to trembling with complicated sentiments of fear caused by the whirling of colors and led him to “unconscious operation”. As he himself said, “Landscape is only an impression, its appearance changing at every moment .” (Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2009) The subjectivity of artistic observer, Monet, whose gaze highlights on the “atmosphere” of changing appearance and he presupposes that there is no such “rightness”/ “real nature”/ “real essence” of appearance.
 9. John House, *Monet: Nature into Art* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1986), 28–9.
 10. See series of *Haystacks: Haystacks in the Morning Effect*, Private Collection; *Haystacks, Midday*, National Gallery of Australia, Canberra, 1890, and *Haystacks, the End of Summer*, Giverny, Musée d’Orsay, Paris; also see series of *Rouen Cathedral: Rouen Cathedral, Midday*, Pushkin Museum, Moscow, Russia, 1894; *Rouen Cathedral, Afternoon (The Portal, Full Sunlight)*, 1892–94, Private Collection; *Rouen Cathedral at Sunset*, Pushkin Museum, Moscow, Russia, 1894. Source from Michel Draguet, Kuang-yi Chen & Mei-ching Fang, *Monet Garden* (Taipei: Taipei Fine Arts Museum, 2011), 176–7.
 11. In this short essay, we couldn’t analyze many landscapes in detail but the general discussion is possible. Readers interested in analysis of the “thought” in western and Chinese paintings and keeping these two axes in mind may be helpful for their own innovative exploration.
 12. See Lecture VI – “About the Research on the Pictorial History of Thought”(第六講「關於圖像的思想史研究」). In Ge Zhaoguang (葛兆光), *Lecture Recording of Research on the History of Thought: Vision, Perspective and Method*(《思想史研究課堂講錄: 視野、角度與方法》)[Text in Chinese] (Beijing: SDX Joint Publishing Company (北京: 生活·讀書·新知三聯書店), 2006), 139–141 (頁139–141).
 13. Zhaoguang Ge (葛兆光), *Lecture Recording of Research on the History of Thought: Vision, Perspective and Method*(《思想史研究課堂講錄: 視野、角度與方法》) [Text in Chinese] (Beijing: SDX Joint Publishing Company (北京: 生活·讀書·新知三聯書店), 2006), 140(頁140).
 14. See *Woman in a Parasol – Madame Monet and His Son* (National Gallery of Art, Washington DC, 1875) Vincent van Gogh painted his *The Starry Night* (The Museum of Modern Art, New York, 1889) also featured by the exaggeration of enlarged blazing stars whirling in the whole sky and dominated almost 3/4 of the whole picture.
 15. Readers may take look at *Promenade near Argenteuil* (Musée Marmottan Monet, Paris, 1873), *Wild Poppies near Argenteuil* (Musée d’Orsay, Paris, 1873), *The Luncheon* (Musée d’Orsay, Paris, 1873), *The Garden of Monet at Argenteuil* (National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1873), *Meadow with Poplars* (Museum of Fine

- Arts, 1875), Poppy Field (Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, 1875), Red Boats, Argenteuil (Fogg Art Museum, Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1875), the snow scene series in Argenteuil (1875), and Landscape: The Parc Monceau (The Metropolitan Museum, New York, 1876), etc.
16. William Hogarth, Ch. IX. – “Of Composition with the Waving-Line,” Ch. X. – “Of Compositions with the Serpentine-Line,” in *The Analysis of Beauty: Written with a View of Fixing the Fluctuating Ideas of Taste* (Glasgow: Good Press, 2019), 57–9, 59–85.
 17. The two S-curved lines were deformed as an amoebic shape turning upside down in this painting.
 18. In terms of the “Doctrine of Three Types of Distance” (Sanyuan fa 三遠法), it’s introduced as follows: “Mountains have three types of distance. Looking up to the mountain’s peak from its foot is called the high distance. From in front of the mountain looking past it to beyond is called deep distance. Looking from a nearby mountain at those more distant is called the level distance.” See Susan Bush & Hsio-yen Shih, “Atmosphere and Spatial Recession,” in *Early Chinese Texts on Painting* (2nd Edition) (HK, China: Hong Kong University Press, 2012), 168–9. Also See Edward S. Casey, “Ch. 6 – Representing Place Elsewhere: Northern Sung Landscape Painting,” in *Representing Place: Landscape Painting and Maps* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2002,) p. 102.
 19. See Robert R. Clewis, ed., “Ch.3 – Guo Xi, from ‘The Interest of Lofty Forests and Springs’ [Lingquan gaozhi《林泉高致》]” in *The Sublime Reader* (London, UK: Bloomsbury Academic, 2019), 41–2. Also see John Hay, Victor H. Mair, Susan Bush & Hsio-Yen Shih, “Ch. 57 – Guo Xi (attrib.), ‘Advice on Landscape’,” in *Hawai’i Reader in Traditional Chinese Culture*, eds. Victor H. Mair, Nancy Shatzman Steinhardt and Paul R. Goldin (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2005), 386.
 20. In terms of the vast expanse of space and infinity of blue sky, Foong provides readers with a beautiful description of Guo Xi’s technique of “Level Distance”. See Foong Ping, “Guo Xi’s Intimate Landscapes and the Case of Old Trees, Level Distance,” *Metropolitan Museum Journal*, 35 (2000): 87–115.
 21. The Museum of Modern Art, MoMA Highlights: 350 Works from the Museum of Modern Art, Harriet Schoenholz Bee, Cassandra Heliczer and Sarah McFadden (eds.) (New York: The Museum of Modern Art, 2013), 80. Also see Aimee Marcereau DeGalan, “A Refuge of Peaceful Meditation,” in KC Studio [Electronic edition] (Kansas City, US: KC Studio, 18, 2020) Retrieved August 11, 2022, from <https://kcstudio.org/a-refuge-of-peaceful-meditation-french-paintings/>
 22. James Cahill also has the similar imaginative parallel to western culture, in the preface of 7A lecture, he said: “Northern Song monumental landscape stands, in my estimation, as a high point in the whole history of Chinese painting, and up there with Gothic cathedrals, or the music of Bach, among the greatest works of man.” See James Cahill, “Notes of 7A – ‘Early Northern Song Landscape’” in *A Pure and Remote View Lectures* [Video Lectures] (Berkeley, CA: Berkeley Institute of East Asian Studies Publication Online Database) Retrieved August 9, 2022, from <https://ieas.berkeley.edu/publications/ieas-publications/james-cahill-video-lectures/pure-and-remote-view-all-lectures#APARV7A>
 23. Xun Jiang (蔣勳), “History of Chinese Art (《中國美術史》) – ‘Fan Kuan’s Travellers Among Mountains and Streams’ (范寬《谿山行旅圖》),” [Video Lecture in Chinese] in *The Gathering with Mr. Yin and Ms Yuan (殷璠小聚)* (Hualien, Taiwan: Tzu Chi Da Ai TV, 2013) (花蓮:慈濟大愛電視台, 2013年7月3日). Retrieved August 9, 2022, from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=T-udf-TmmP8>
 24. Wai-kam Ho & Dawn Ho Delbanco, “Tung Ch’i-ch’ang’s Transcendence of History and Art,” in *The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Wai-kam Ho & Judith G. Smith (eds.), The Century of Tung Ch’i-ch’ang 1555-1636, Vol. I* (Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 1992),
 25. Lin-can Li (李霖燦), “The Landscape Paintings of the Northern and Southern Sung Dynasties,” in *Research on the Famous Chinese Painting (《中國名畫研究》)* [Text in Chinese], Hangzhou, China: Zhejiang University, 2013) (杭州:浙江大學), 364 (頁 364).
 26. James Cahill, “Notes 7B – ‘Late Northern Song Landscape and Guo Xi,’” in *A Pure and Remote View Lectures* [Video Lectures] (Berkeley, CA: Berkeley Institute of East Asian Studies Publication Online Database) Retrieved August

- 9, 2022, from <https://ieas.berkeley.edu/publications/ieas-publications/james-cahill-video-lectures/pure-and-remote-view-all-lectures#APARV7B>
27. Lin-can Li (李霖燦), "The Landscape Paintings of the Northern and Southern Sung Dynasties." in *Research on the Famous Chinese Painting* (《中國名畫研究》) [Text in Chinese], Hangzhou, China: Zhejiang University, 2013) (杭州:浙江大學), 365 (頁 365).
 28. Kuang-yi Chen, "Monet – The Eternal Impressionist," in Draguet, Michel, Kuang-yi Chen & Mei-ching Fang, *Monet Garden* (Taipei: Taipei Fine Arts Museum, 2011), 67.
 29. Burton Watson, trans, Ch.20 – "The Mountain Tree" (山木) in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)
 30. Lai Huiling (賴慧玲) specializing in Chinese philosophy especially Confucianism, philosophical Daoism and religious Daoism serves as associate professor at I-Shou University, Taiwan. These four aesthetic criteria in Chinese landscape painting proposed by Lai when the author of this paper attended her series of lectures on Daoist wisdom and art of life at I-Shou University (義守大學), Kaohsiung, Taiwan, since 2009 to 2021.
 31. See Wen-mei Hsu (許文美), intro, "Ma Lin's The Hidden Fragrance and Scattered Shadows (宋馬麟《暗香疏影》) of Song Dynasty," in *Hear From Me: Stories of the NPM's Collection* (《聽我說文物》) [Video introduction] (Taipei: National Palace Museum, 2021) (台北: 國立故宮博物院, 2021年) Retrieved August 9, 2022, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5_UuHY1gXBc Readers interested in this painting may make comparison to the Orchid also created by Ma Lin. See Maxwell K. Hearn, "Ch.14 – 'The Perfection of Nature,'" in *How to Read Chinese Paintings* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2008). Hearn's description well alluded to Zhuangzi's criterion of "Simplicity," "Clarity," and "Exquisiteness" that made us appreciate this leaf of painting as a phrase, in short, "Its form is simple and the color is crystalline-clear" (形簡色清) and its implication of spiritual realm is meaningful with profundity (意味深長).
 32. Wing-Tsit Chan (陳榮捷), trans, "Chapter 39," in *Laozi, Laozi* [Electric text] (Terebess Asia Online (Tao) database, 1963) Retrieved August 9, 2022, from https://terebehu.com/english/tao/_index.html
 33. On this website, readers may find many creditable versions of translation in Chinese philosophical classics, many of which are out of print, not easily to be collected but still significant in traditionally academic context. Readers may make their own judgment by comparison of different versions in history. I chose Chan's translation of Laozi's words in terms of this passage because Chan's usage corresponded to Huai Wang's interpretation of Laozi. See Huai Wang (王淮), *Exploration and Annotation of Laozi* (《老子探義》) [Text in Chinese] (New Taipei City: The Commercial Press, 2017) (新北市:臺灣商務印書館, 1969年初版, 2017年第二版第一刷).
 34. This further interpretation is explicated by the author of this paper.
 35. Here I quote the interesting passage of the parable as follows: "Woodworker Qing carved a piece of wood and made a bell stand, and when it was finished, everyone who saw it marveled, for it seemed to be the work of gods or spirits. When the marquis of Lu saw it, he asked, 'What art is it you have?' Qing replied, 'I am only a craftsman—how would I have any art?' There is one thing, however. When I am going to make a bell stand, I never let it wear out my energy. I always fast in order to still my mind[heart/心xin]. When I have fasted for three days, I no longer have any thought of congratulations or rewards, of titles or stipends. When I have fasted for five days, I no longer have any thought of praise or blame, of skill or clumsiness. And when I have fasted for seven days, I am so still that I forget I have four limbs and a form and body. By that time, the ruler and his court no longer exist for me. My skill is concentrated, and all outside distractions fade away. After that, I go into the mountain forest and examine the Heavenly nature of the trees. If I find one of superlative forms and I can see a bell stand there, [then] I put my hand to the job of carving; if not, I let it go. This way I am simply matching up 'Heaven' [Dao/ Way Natural Law] with 'Heaven'. That's probably the reason that people wonder if the results were not made by spirits." See Burton Watson, trans, "Ch. 19 – 'Mastering Life,' (達生) in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)

- Chen & Mei-ching Fang, *Monet Garden* (Taipei: Taipei Fine Arts Museum, 2011), 69.
36. Burton Watson, trans, Chapter 13 – “The Way of Heaven” (天道) in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)
 37. Maxwell K. Hearn, Ch.9 “Envisioning Introspection” in *How to Read Chinese Paintings* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2008)
 38. Maxwell K. Hearn, Ch.9 “Envisioning Introspection” in *How to Read Chinese Paintings* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2008)
 39. Burton Watson, trans, Cha.13 – “The Way of Heaven” in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)
 40. Burton Watson, trans, Ch.19 in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)
 41. Burton Watson, trans, Ch.19 in *The Complete Works of Zhuangzi* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)
 42. Jiang, Xun (蔣勳). “History of Chinese Art – Pure and Remote View of Streams and Mountains by Xia Gui of the Song dynasty”. [Video Lecture in Chinese] In *The Gathering with Mr. Yin and Ms Yuan. (殷瑗小聚)*. Hualien, Taiwan: Tzu Chi Da Ai TV (花蓮·慈濟大愛電視台).
 43. See Ch.23 – ‘Gengsang Chu’ (庚桑楚) of Zhuangzi. The passage quoted here is translated by the author of this paper. According to Ouyang version, the original Chinese passage appears as “宇泰定者，發乎天光。發乎天光者，人見其人，物見其物。人有脩者，乃今有恒” could be translated as “when Heaven/Sky itself serenely settled down, the heavenly light permeates all things on earth. Under the heavenly, divide light, humans present human nature and matters/phenomenon present their own nature. Humans self-cultivated with peace and serenity will lead them to everlasting eternity and infinity” while firstly presented at the 2022 ISCP conference. However, compared to the collation and annotation of Shumin Wang (王叔岷), he precisely indicated that the Chinese character “宇” (yu) in this passage refers to “heart” (心/ xin); another Chinese word “泰” (tai) means “great” (大/ da); still other one “定” is meant to “settled down,” “tranquilized,” and “placid” (靜/jing). The next significant term “heavenly light” (天光/ tien-guang) relating to the theme of this paper

is signified to “wisdom” (慧/ hui). Therefore, the whole passage could be translated to “When humans heart [heart-mind system] is settled down, tranquilized with great peace, it originates from heavenly light that means infinite transcendental wisdom. When it comes from transcendental wisdom, humans present human nature and matters/phenomenon present their own nature [as things-in-themselves].” The term “者” (it/ zhe) as a pronoun refers to “heart,” according to Guo Xian (郭向), this passage also alludes to “empty room generates white light”/ “[in an] empty room [it/ placid heart/ tranquilized heart-mind system] generates white light (transcendental wisdom)” (虛室生白/ shu shi sheng bai) in the Chapter 4 – “In the World of Men” of Zhuangzi. Wang collated the explication of Ma (馬氏) in which he said Xue Xuen (薛瑄) furtherly explained as “When heart is greatly settled down, it generates ‘Clarity’ (明/ming) / 心定則明). Similarly, 宣穎 (Ying Xuan) explicated this symbolic image of empty room as ‘tranquilized clear heart’ by proposing that “when one is tranquilized and peaceful, one is ‘empty,’ ‘selfishless’ in one’s heart-mind; when one’s heart-mind is selfishless (humble, not arrogant, not being an egoist in our contemporary usage), one’s heart becomes transparent and clear.” (靜則虛，虛則明) The reason why the author of this paper choose Shumin Wang’s collation and annotation here rather than Ouyang’s translation from ancient Chinese to contemporary Chinese lies in that Wang’s interpretation is better coherent to the content of Chapter 23, Chapter 4 and other chapters within *Zhuangzi* in terms of contextual consideration in spite of the fact that two versions, both Ouyang and Wang’s annotations, contain collations down to the ages in traditional Chinese academic history, and both of which also have similarity to good advantage, which means, in their annotations, they quite often explicated the reason why chose one’s interpretation instead of others that left readers “empty space” to make judgement by themselves. See Chao Ouyang & Jingxien Ouyang (歐陽超, 歐陽景賢), Ch. 23 – “Gengsan Chu” (庚桑楚), in *The Annotation and Translation of Zhuangzi* (Vol. 1-2) (*Zhuang shi yi* 《莊子釋譯》(上)、(下)) [Text in Chinese] (Taipei: Liren Bookstore, 1992) (台北: 里仁書局, 1992年台一版), 945-53 (頁945-53). Also see Shumin

Wang (王叔岷), *The Collation and Interpretation of Zhuangzi* (*Zhuangzi jiao chuen*《莊子校銓》), Vol. 2 (中冊) [Text in Chinese], (No. 88, Special Issue of Institute of History and Philology, Academia Sinica) (中央研究院歷史語言研究所專刊第八十八輯) (Nangang, Taipei: Institute of History and Philology, Academia Sinica, 1999) (台北南港: 中央研究院歷史語言研究所, 1999年), 886 (頁886).